



**SPECIAL MEETING  
THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
MONDAY, APRIL 10, 2006  
COMMUNITY DESIGN STUDIO  
7506 E. INDIAN SCHOOL ROAD  
SCOTTSDALE, AZ**

**PRESENT:** Ed Wimmer, Chairman  
George Hartz, Vice-Chairman  
Nancy Dallett, Commissioner  
Dezbah Hatathli, Commissioner  
Kathy Howard, Commissioner  
Paul Winslow, Commissioner

**STAFF:** Debbie Abele  
Don Meserve

**OTHERS:** George Martins  
Tammy West

**1. Introductions and Roll Call**

Chairman Wimmer called the special meeting to order, noting that this takes the place of the regularly scheduled meeting for Thursday, April 13. A roll call confirmed the presence of Commissioners as noted above.

**PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**

**2. 6726 East Coronado Road Certificate of Appropriateness, Case 5-HP-2006**

Request for review of site plan and elevations for a rear addition in Village Grove 1-6 historic district.

Mr. Don Meserve presented photographs and elevations of the house and described proposed changes. He noted that this house is considered a contributing house to the Village Grove historic district in terms of the existing condition of the house. Staff recommends approval of this application.

Commissioner Dallett asked Mr. Meserve whether or not the alterations will be visible from the street. He replied that from the neighbor's driveway a little of the project would be visible. Vice-Chair Hartz commented he had visited the site and it would be a challenge to see it from the street. Commissioner Dallett concluded that this application is not in opposition to Policy 14 of the preservation guidelines for Village Grove.

Commissioner Winslow commented that this is an example of the spirit of meeting the intent of the guidelines. This project and the other application considered tonight are totally appropriate in terms of what the Commission is trying to accomplish.

**VICE-CHAIRMAN HARTZ MOVED TO APPROVE A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR CASE 5-HP-2006 AT 6726 EAST CORONADO ROAD FOR THE ROOM ADDITION AT THE REAR OF THE PROPERTY AS SUBMITTED, RECOGNIZING ITS CONFORMANCE WITH THE PRESERVATION GUIDELINES FOR THE VILLAGE GROVE HISTORIC DISTRICT. COMMISSIONER HATATHLI SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

**3. 7344 E. Cypress Street Certificate of Appropriateness, Case 6-HP-2006**

Request for review of site plan and elevations for rear addition, carport enclosure, new roof, removing aluminum siding and remodel of an existing single-family residence in the Town and Country historic district.

Mr. Don Meserve presented photographs, elevations and floor plans of the house, explaining the proposed changes. Staff recommends approval of this application.

Commissioner Howard asked the Applicant about his plans to demolish the metal carport addition. Mr. Martins explained that the carport in question is an extra aluminum carport. It will simply be removed and nothing is to be put in its place. On the rear elevation, the Applicant noted he was considering doubling the size of his kitchen window.

Chairman Wimmer asked the Applicant whether the roof covering the patio is going to be virtually level. The Applicant said it will have a little more pitch than it has now.

Vice-Chairman Hartz asked the Applicant what material would be used on the west side of the garage. The Applicant said he was thinking of using T-111 scored plywood similar to the west side of the house. Commissioners discussed that this would be visible from the street, would not have been used at that time, and that matching block would be more in character on the front of the home. Commissioner Winslow suggested that masonry would be preferable but it would be more expensive and more work. A discussion ensued on the most appropriate design and materials.

**VICE-CHAIRMAN HARTZ MADE A MOTION TO APPROVE A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS IN CASE 6-HP-2006 LOCATED AT 7344 EAST CYPRESS STREET, APPROVING THE PLAN FOR RENOVATION AS SUBMITTED, WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT THE T-111 WILL NOT BE PLACED IN THE FRONT, OR SOUTH, ELEVATION OF THE PROPERTY AND THAT, IF PRACTICAL, GLASS BE USED IN THE LOW TRIANGULAR AREA ABOVE THE GARAGE DOOR AND ACKNOWLEDGING THE CHANGE IN THE PLAN TO INCLUDE A LARGER KITCHEN WINDOW IN THE NORTH ELEVATION. IN ORDER TO IMPROVE BOTH THE AESTHETICS AND THE STRENGTH OF THE CORNER ELEMENTS OF THE GARAGE, THE MASONRY IS TO BE PLACED ON THE WEST ELEVATION TO A DEPTH EQUAL TO THE PIER FACING THE STREET.**

**THIS CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS IS GRANTED BECAUSE THE REST OF THE COMPONENTS OF THE HOME ARE IN CONFORMANCE WITH THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION GUIDELINES FOR THE TOWN AND COUNTRY HISTORIC DISTRICT. APART FROM THE LOCATION OF THE CARPORT, THE PROPOSED ALTERATIONS ARE NOT VISIBLE FROM THE STREET. THE CHANGE TO THE MATERIALS IS NOTED. THE**

**MASSING, ROOF SHAPE, AND PROPORTIONS ARE APPROPRIATE, AND THE HEIGHT OF THE ADDITION IS IN CORRECT PROPORTION TO THE EXISTING HOUSE. THE LOCATION AND ARRANGEMENT OF MATERIALS ON WINDOWS AND DOORS IS IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE GUIDELINES, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE KITCHEN WINDOW AS NOTED.**

**COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

**REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

**4. Minutes: March 2, 2006 Special Meeting**

Chairman Wimmer noted that the date on the draft minutes is incorrectly shown as 2005, not 2006.

**COMMISSIONER WINSLOW MOVED APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE MARCH 2, 2006 SPECIAL MEETING, WITH THE DATE CORRECTED TO REFLECT THE YEAR 2006. COMMISSIONER HOWARD SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED BY A UNANIMOUS VOTE OF SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

**5. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: 5th Avenue Preservation Strategies**

Ms. Abele stated that this was a follow-up to earlier discussions regarding developing a preservation revitalization strategy for the Fifth Avenue area. Time is of the essence if this area is to be retained. Ms. Abele noted that even though this area is not designated yet, the consensus is that Fifth Avenue is an important resource and staff felt that work should start immediately.

She has been in contact with Mr. Fred Unger, the primary property owner. He was unable to attend tonight's meeting but is interested in any and all assistance that could be available.

Ms. Abele distributed a list of recommended incentives that might be made available to that area. The ESI Corporation prepared a report for the Chamber of Commerce and the Fifth Avenue property owners on the tenant mix on Fifth Avenue. Mr. Meserve had written a summary of their findings that he distributed to the Commissioners. Ms. Abele suggested that some Commission members and staff could meet with the Chamber of Commerce to talk about preserving the distinctive quality of the Fifth Avenue buildings.

Turning to the list handed out on recommended incentives, Ms. Abele remarked that the Commission might like to prioritize these and plan approaches to City Councilmembers, if possible before the summer break.

Chairman Wimmer stated he has some concerns regarding the rather negative attitude in the report to the storefronts. He opined that the Commission needs to develop a strategy to help people perceive this as a positive. Noting that new upscale shopping centers such as Kierland Commons draw upon 1930s architecture, he commented that the Commission needs to make some architectural rationale to the Chamber of Commerce so that they perceive the character of the area as being an asset.

Commissioner Winslow noted that ESI Corporation does economic analysis. When he thinks of this area he wonders why it is not as vibrant as it could be. Chairman Wimmer opined that the

area needs a chic quality with a variety of boutiques. The key may be in finding the right mix of tenants as large shopping centers do.

Ms. Abele noted that staff has researched what the tenant mix was in the past. This information could be presented in an interesting fashion to give a different theme to a marketing plan. In the past various promotional events were held including fashion shows in the street. A discussion ensued about how to present this message and what the role of the Commission should be.

Commissioner Winslow commented that there should be an ongoing series of events and an aggressive marketing plan to promote Fifth Avenue. Downtown Scottsdale used to be a tourist destination. Although there is competition, the current redevelopment provides an opportunity for a new dynamic. The area needs an anchor tenant. Chairman Wimmer noted that the report does not take emerging development and new pedestrian traffic patterns into consideration. The new parking garage is a huge asset.

Commissioner Howard remarked that the exhibition of Mid-Century Modern Native Art currently at the Heard North could possibly be moved downtown when it closes.

Commissioner Winslow noted that the ideas under discussion are short term. Long-term ideas also need consideration.

Vice-Chairman Hartz noted that given the current situation, one priority is to make sure that the Chamber of Commerce and the Tenants Association understands that there is a broader context than just the retail issues. Educating the Chamber of Commerce is something that the Historic Preservation Commission can undertake.

Commissioner Winslow remarked that one of the weaknesses of historic preservation is not being sensitive to the economic development considerations that would make the historic district economically viable. They might suggest that the City invest a certain amount of money in things supportive of historic preservation.

Mr. Meserve shared discussions staff had with the Economic Vitality Department. Commissioner Howard commented that if the Commission could develop a presentation about the history of Fifth Avenue it would be informative for the Economic Vitality Department and others. Visually appealing materials could be assembled and used in the presentation and in downtown promotions. For the next meeting, Ms. Abele noted that staff would draft an outline for the presentation and collect visual materials.

The Commission discussed the actions to be taken. Chairman Wimmer noted that they could use the summer months to work on solid planning to develop an impressive program that could be presented widely.

Commissioner Winslow asked staff how realistic the incentives on the list are. Ms. Abele replied that the Department of Economic Vitality advised them that all the suggestions are feasible but it is up to City Council to make a decision. She added that they were told this is an opportune moment.

Commissioner Dallett suggested arranging a meeting in early June to bring together the Department of Economic Vitality, the Chamber of Commerce, the Downtown Merchants Association, and property owners. The meeting would start with a presentation about the history

of Fifth Avenue to open the dialog and provide the context and background. Vice-Chairman Hartz undertook to contact Joan Fudala to see if she would be willing to assist.

**6. Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Saturday, April 8th Rehab Program Workshop and Two Neighborhood Meetings**

Ms. Abele reported good attendance at the Rehab Program Workshop. Those who attended had to wait in line to talk with the architects but were happy to wait. She remarked the workshop was worthwhile and probably should be offered periodically. Mr. Meserve added that staff will check with the on-call architects as to schedule and frequency.

The neighborhood meetings were held in the afternoon with residents of Cavalier Vista 3 and 4, and Scottsdale Estates 4. Staff field surveys revealed a dramatic change in Cavalier Vista compared to the integrity maps completed two years earlier. Cavalier Vista went from ten to over 40 non-contributing homes. She presented photographs of houses in the neighborhood to illustrate this point. Ms. Abele walked through the neighborhood herself to get a full sense and noted that, for the most part, the changes have been well-intended improvements but not within the historic style of the neighborhood. Detailing has been removed and new materials have been used on the fronts of the houses.

Ms. Abele visited Scottsdale Estates and found that it remains substantially intact. Her recommendation is that Cavalier Vista be ranked lower. She noted that, to date, the decisions about which neighborhoods should be designated historic have been made on the relative merits of the neighborhoods. Ms. Abele commented that it would be appropriate to revisit other top twenty 1950s neighborhoods they had considered. A lot has happened in the last two years. She feels that Scottsdale Estates should remain under consideration.

Commissioner Howard suggested considering Whitwood as a high-end neighborhood, since it seems that Sherwood Heights is not a viable candidate. Chairman Wimmer commented that the Historic Register Committee and staff need to focus on doing this research, and asked Commissioner Howard as the committee chair to see to this.

Commissioner Dallett asked whether the changes observed in Cavalier Vista were a consequence of the neighborhood becoming aware of the possibility of designation and deciding to implement exterior changes while they could do so without hindrance. Ms. Abele replied that she is inclined to believe that many of the original homeowners have sold and this has caused the change. She added that when the initial meetings were held, many elderly homeowners came to Saturday morning meetings but would not go to evening meetings. The economy has also had an effect as home prices have risen very steeply, encouraging reinvestment in area homes.

**7. Committee Reports/Meeting Schedules/Discussion:**

- **Community Outreach Committee**

Vice-Chairman Hartz reported the Downtown Walking Tour is set for Saturday, May 6. This year two tours will be offered. One, to be led by Joan Fudala, will focus on the arts and tourism, and will take in the Hotel Valley Ho. The other tour will focus on Early Town buildings in Old Town with JoAnn Handley as the guide. Vice-Chairman Hartz noted he has sent e-mails out to about 50 people on a mailing list. Mr. Meserve is working with CAPA staff on City publicity.

- **Historic Register Committee**

Commissioner Howard reported the Committee met on March 8<sup>th</sup> and discussed the work program for 2006 approved by the Commission. Mr. Meserve noted that as a result of the meeting he has started a draft Watch List that the committee will be working on.

- **Historic Residential Exterior Rehabilitation Committee**

The Commission will now approve exterior rehabilitation funds for projects in historic districts without needing City Council approval for the funding.

- **Taliesin West Liaison**

Commissioner Dallett reported that on Friday, April 7<sup>th</sup> the Taliesin Board of Directors approved the general direction of the first draft of the master plan for the Special Campus (SC) rezoning application. She will bring a copy of the draft master plan to the next meeting.

Commissioner Dallett apologized that she had forgotten the deadline for the Governor's Preservation Award and they were unable to make a nomination for Janie Ellis's project.

8. **Report/Discussion: HPO/Staff Report and Announcements**

Ms. Abele asked the Commission whether they wanted to change the time of future meetings. The consensus was to meet at 5:30 p.m. at least for the summer months.

9. **Commissioner Comments and Announcements**

None.

10. **Public Comments**

None.

11. **Future Meetings and Agenda Items**

The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, May 11, 2006. Commissioner Howard noted she will be unable to attend.

12. **Adjournment**

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting was adjourned at 7:16 p.m.

AVtronics